저작자표시-비영리-변경금지 2.0 대한민국

이용자는 아래의 조건을 따르는 경우에 한하여 자유롭게

- 이 저작물을 복제, 배포, 전송, 전시, 공연 및 방송할 수 있습니다.

다음과 같은 조건을 따라야 합니다:

저작자표시. 귀하는 원저작자를 표시하여야 합니다.

비영리. 귀하는 이 저작물을 영리 목적으로 이용할 수 없습니다.

변경금지. 귀하는 이 저작물을 개작, 변형 또는 가공할 수 없습니다.

- 귀하는, 이 저작물의 재이용이나 배포의 경우, 이 저작물에 적용된 이용허락조건을 명확하게 나타내어야 합니다.
- 저작권자로부터 별도의 허가를 받으면 이러한 조건들은 적용되지 않습니다.

저작권법에 따른 이용자의 권리는 위의 내용에 의하여 영향을 받지 않습니다.

이것은 이용허락규약(Legal Code)을 이해하기 쉽게 요약한 것입니다.

Disclaimer
Emergence of a Human Rights Network

-Normative Reaction to North Korean Laborers in Europe-

August 2019
Graduate School of Social Sciences

Seoul National University

International Relations and Diplomacy Major

Flora Antonia Smit
Emergence of a Human Rights Network
Normative Reaction to North Korean laborers in Europe

Jo Dong-Joon

Submitting a Master Thesis of Social Sciences

August 2019

Graduate School of Social Sciences
Seoul National University
International Relations and Diplomacy Major

Flora Antonia Smit

Confirming the Master’s Thesis written by
Flora Antonia Smit

July 2019

Chair____________________
Vice Chair________________
Examiner_________________
ABSTRACT

Recent research in international political science has increasingly focused on the development of norms and related changes in the behavior of political actors at the domestic and international level. Contemporary constructivists tend to highlight the success of norm changes in terms of the norm life-cycle. However, this thesis goes beyond simply analyzing the end result - that is, whether or not a norm is ultimately manifested. Rather, by applying a Delphi method, this thesis seeks to describe the process of how a (human rights) network emerges and the direct influence of the development of norms on this emergence. This thesis is a case study of North Korean migrants working under harsh labor conditions in Europe, an issue that has received extensive media attention in recent years. It describes how norms originate and how networks are established by norm entrepreneurs. Various source materials, including direct interviews with norm entrepreneurs actively involved in this case, highlights their role and their contribution to this issue. In addition, the thesis elucidates the difficulties these entrepreneurs encountered in the past and will encounter in the future, as well as their current struggles.

Keywords: Norms, North Korea, Norm Entrepreneurs, Labor Issues, Human Rights, Network

Student No.: 2017-22084
TABLE OF CONTENTS

CHAPTER I: INTRODUCTION.................................................................1
  1.1 INTRODUCTION ...........................................................................1
  1.2 RESEARCH QUESTIONS .............................................................2
  1.3 METHODOLOGY .......................................................................3
  1.4 CHAPTER OUTLINE .................................................................4

CHAPTER II: NORM STUDIES IN POLITICAL SCIENCE .........................8
  2.1 CONSTRUCTIVISTS’ CONTRIBUTION TO THE GENESIS OF NETWORK AND NORM STUDIES ..............8
  2.2 INTRODUCTION OF NETWORK AND NORM STUDIES TO POLITICAL SCIENCE ..................10
  2.3 EVOLUTION OF NORM STUDIES IN POLITICAL SCIENCE ..................................................14
  2.4 RECENT EMPHASIS ON NORM AND NETWORK EMERGENCE IN POLITICAL SCIENCE ..........18

CHAPTER III: NORTH KOREAN LABOR ISSUE IN EUROPE ..................23
  3.1 HISTORY AND FACTS ON NORTH KOREAN LABOR IN EUROPE .........................................23
  3.2 MEDIA ATTENTION TO THE NORTH KOREAN LABOR ISSUE ............................................26
  3.3 DEVELOPMENTS IN NORTH KOREAN LABOR IN EUROPE ................................................29

CHAPTER IV: NORM ENTREPRENEURS IN THE EMERGENCE OF NORTH KOREAN LABOR ISSUE .................................................................38
  4.1 IDENTIFICATION OF KEY ENTREPRENEURS ....................................................................38
  4.2 WHAT ARE THE MOTIVATIONS OF THESE NORM ENTREPRENEURS TO BECOME INVOLVED IN THIS ISSUE? .................................................................41
  4.3 EMERGENCE OF THE NETWORK ON NORTH KOREAN LABOR ISSUE ..................................47

CHAPTER V: CONCLUSION ................................................................52
  5.1 SUMMARY: FROM NORTH KOREA TO BRUSSELS .................................................................52
  5.2 KEY FINDINGS OF THIS PAPER .........................................................................................53
  5.3 FURTHER RESEARCH AND LIMITATIONS ...........................................................................55

BIBLIOGRAPHY .................................................................................57
CHAPTER I: INTRODUCTION

1.1 Introduction

Small ripples can swell into larger waves, just as minor historical moments can produce monumental, often unpredictable outcomes. In the age of mass media, where all kinds of media outlets play critical roles in shaping public perceptions on issues, seemingly minor events that gain media coverage can snowball into larger political and social movements, since individuals and groups get inspired to take up causes based on what they gathered from the news. In particular, events that have shock value tend to trigger stronger reactions from the general public. An exemplary case was the tragic accident in 2014, where one man’s death led to a widespread response from non-governmental organizations and political actors. His name was ChŏnKyŏngsu (전경수), who was a North Korean migrant labor working at a ship construction site. His cheap inflammable clothing caught on fire and led to his death.

This case triggered multiple investigations into issues surrounding North Korean migrant labor rights, as well as issues surrounding slave-like labor conditions in Europe. Not only non-governmental organizations got involved, but even the members of the European Parliament found an initiative to stand up for this issue.
1.2 Research Questions

The central aim of this paper is to research the active role that different norm entrepreneurs played in response to the death of the North Korean migrant laborer. Although many studies have tried to investigate what affects the emergence of new norms and networks, this thesis specifically focuses on the initial spark and ensuring process, rather than the final outcome. As such, the process of norm stimulation and subsequent regulation together with how a network evolves from this are the central focus of this paper's analytical framework.

The main question of this thesis is as follows: What can the field of Norm Studies learn from the network of norm entrepreneurs who work on the issue of North Korean laborers within Europe? In order to answer this question, the thesis will break down the main topic into four parts and six questions: 1) What is the position of Network and Norm Studies within the field of International Relations? 2) What are the facts and history surrounding the issue of North Korean laborers in Europe? 3) Who are the key actors in this issue? 4) How did these key actors get involved? 5) What actions did norm entrepreneurs take in order to change the situation? 6) What were their successes and failures? Answering these questions will help us understand the context in which norm entrepreneurs work and thereby help us evaluate their overall role in the field of Norm Studies. The concluding part of this thesis provides key findings, further research suggestions and shortcomings of the research.

This topic is an important one in contemporary politics since it crosses national borders and shows that the impact of one tiny accident can stir around a call for a change of adopted norms. Although in Norm Studies much has been talked about how norms are created and adopted into a certain situation, this thesis will add the importance of how an initiation of norms snowballs into a huge involvement with
influential people all around the world and how this network is build and formed. This is especially an important topic in this time of era where multimedia daily influences how we tend to think and live.

1.3 Methodology

In order to contribute to the field of network and norm studies, based primarily on data collected through interviews with key actors, this thesis will help illustrate the process of a network emergence through a case study. This method will reinforce previous findings in the fields as a whole, as well as contribute an important and unique perspective based on new, groundbreaking source material.

This thesis will rely on empirical legal research to define the status of North Korean workers in Europe and apply the Delphi method to assess informational factors to explain why and how members of the European Parliament, such as Thomas Händel, Agnes Jongerius and Kati Piri, have been actively involved in this issue. To this end, the thesis will carry out interviews with activists working on this issue in order to corroborate quantitative analysis with qualitative findings. Thus, this thesis hopes to not simply back up earlier studies on norms and networks, but rather to provide a close-up investigation on the emergence of networks and the efforts made to provide and maintain norm changes.

The Delphi method is a structured technique aimed for providing help in communication issues between several actors at play. The original version of the method consists of multiple rounds of questionnaires aimed at these actors in order to revise their given answers when situated next to the answers that have been given by the other actors involved. This process accumulates a convergence towards a more ‘common’ answer that speaks as opinion for the whole group involved. As so, the Delphi
method is often used in states of conflict between several actors that are either directly or indirectly involved with each other.

Although the Delphi method is often used for large groups and mostly within areas of either economics of business, the scale of the Delphi method can change considerably depending on the case it is adapted to. The Delphi method can even be used for smaller groups where the method is executed through face-to-face interaction and interviews.

The specific form of Delphi method that would apply to this thesis would be the so-called ‘Policy Delphi’. This method of Delphi introduces an approach that aims at structuring and discussing different views between the various actors rather than focusing on the outcome or result of the problem that is involved. As so, this thesis does not aim to bring the different arguments of the interviewees together, but instead will have its focus on how these arguments came to be and how they relate to the problem in itself. The main objectives of the interviewees were to gain a grasp of understanding as to why these actors became involved in the case study (motivation), how these actors became involved with each other in creating a network and lastly, what the possibilities and the limits of this human rights network that was created for this case study are.

1.4 Chapter Outline

The paper is divided into three sections. First, it offers a short summary of preexisting research on network and norm studies. Secondly, this thesis will cover the case study itself and the relevant specifics/context of the case. The third section explores the reactions and responses of the actors involved. Based on the previous three sections, this thesis offers a novel understanding of how networks develop
from local grassroots to national politics, offers insights into what actions may be necessary to bring forth a reaction in norms, and clarifies the requirements for both a norm and a network to succeed or fail. This thesis will hopefully contribute to future changes and improve the condition of North Korean laborers in Europe.

The literature review will provide a theoretical framework and background of the rise and influential range of international norms and social networks. After a short introduction on constructivism, which one may call the birthplace of the so-called study of norms and networks, this thesis will 1) give a short introduction to network theory and try to deepen and clarify the notion of norms itself, 2) what studies claim about the effect circuit norms tend to have and 3) how these norms through social networks impact both domestic and international politics. After a critical examination of these aspects, this thesis will delve into a particular case study that demonstrates the substantial presence of both norms and networks. The case study does not aim to back up the results of how norms can be initiated and be used in practice, but rather to describe the rise of a network that shared a preference on norm change and how actors are engaged in the process.

The second chapter of this thesis is concerned with the facts and history surrounding the case study of North Korean laborers active in Europe. This thesis will closely follow the major events and processes that led up to the present situation in chronological order, from the initial spark of media attention on North Korean laborers due to the tragic death of one man to the actions of the European Union. The second sub-chapter of this section focuses on the media's reactions during the initial stages of the issue of North Korean laborers and turned it into an international issue. *Slaves to the System*, a ground-breaking report by Remco Breuker of Leiden University, will be used as a close guide on the facts and developments of this issue.
The last part of the thesis will analyze both international norms and social networks, as shown throughout the case study. This part will explain how politics can be influenced by non-governmental organs when it comes to present issues such as the case study given here. This thesis will not rely solely on interviews to research the motives of these three members and their involvement. In order to build a clear dataset, this thesis will also use previous interviews, reports from other activists and articles concerning these members. For example, in an interview Kati Piri clearly states that “her deepest motivation to be a member of the European Parliament is to be able to defend democratic principles and to respect human rights within Europe”.\(^1\) In another interview of both Jongerius and Piri they state that Europe should be the continent that lives up to the promise of granting everybody the right to equality.\(^2\) Moreover, in their Written Questions, debates and actions, we may further deduce their concerns and political positions. Remco Breuker, a professor at Leiden University who may be regarded as one of the main actors involved in this issue, has added data and research to the case study which will help examine the actions involved.

The last chapter is the conclusion that provides the key findings and shortcomings of this paper, along with suggestions for further research in the future. What this thesis aims to show is how this case study is an addition to future research on norm studies and how networks of norm entrepreneurs develop and evolve. Hopefully, in the future, this thesis may help pave anew path in to politics that is a different one from previous assumptions. A detailed description of the process in this case study will also help create new grounds for conducting research into the process of norm initiation and network emergence.

\(^1\)PVDA (Partij voor de Arbeid) Labor Party. 2014. Interview met Kati Piri, de nr. drie van de lijst voor Europa. \url{https://internationaal.pvda.nl/nieuws/interview-met-kati-piri-de-nr-drie-van-de-lijst-voor-europa/} (Dutch) (Accessed on 2018-05-04)

CHAPTER II: NORM STUDIES IN POLITICAL SCIENCE

The literature review of this section will mostly cover the study of norms and networks. Although both the term ‘norm’ and ‘network’ have become well-known and frequently used words in contemporary studies concerning politics and international relations, the theory that helped bring these phenomena to the forefront of research in the first place is quite recent. The first sub-section will summarize and explain this relatively new theory, and the next sub-section will introduce the field of network and norm studies itself. The following part will delve into the development of this study, as well as a deeper look at the four waves of norm studies. Lastly, a sub-section will be devoted to the recent adaptation of network and norm studies in political science and international relations.

2.1 Constructivists’ contribution to the genesis of network and norm studies

Within the field of international relations, a variety of theories have sought to explain how states behave within the international atmosphere. The most prominent theories are realism and liberalism. However, since the 1980s and early 1990s, a new theory known as constructivism emerged. This new theory established a more balanced approach on the more material and rational theories that were then dominant in international relations and political science. Constructivism laid the foundations of a theory that emphasized the social construction of what were considered "purely" political processes.

The constructivist view differed vastly from the prevailing theories that only locked on to elements such as identity, nature, interests and behavior of important actors. Classical realist theories and even the early liberalist theories for the most part simply assumed that these elements were fixed, leading
them to a fundamentally deterministic view of human behavior that precluded any real social progress or change. By contrast, constructivism has a broader notion of social processes in which societies can be shaped by the subjective choices of individual actors, making international societies far more susceptible to change. In short, constructivists are far more skeptical about measuring and anticipating international policy on the basis of human nature. Though there may be some overall trend or pattern to political actions, constructivists would argue that human nature is just one of the many other processes that can shape the course of politics.

One important factor in constructivism, and of essential importance to this thesis, is the phenomenona of norms and networks. In reality, norms and normative theories have been central to the study of politics for at least two millennia, spanning from Plato and Aristotle until E.H. Carr in the twentieth century. However, normative theories and in the long run, constructivism as well, was often criticized throughout the 1970s and 1980s for its lack of empirical proof. For example, Keohane, one of the most known professors on the field of neoliberalism, argued the greatest weakness of constructivism was the lack of a clear reflective research program to back up their critical arguments. Finnemore et al. further criticized constructivism for being hardly ‘measurable.’ Thus, the schools that were then dominant in the 70s and 80s were reluctant to support this new approach and favored models based on economic assumptions. Realists began to recast the pursuit of power as "utility maximization" and, following the economists, tended to explain utility functions in material terms only. Social progress was seen as an inherently unpredictable and ideological concept that was unamenable to analysis or measurement, and was therefore ignored by most classical theories.

---

Even though Adler and Wendt, some of the most important scholars in constructivism, poured their efforts into consolidating the foundations of constructivism and tried to appeal to a wider audience by attempting to build bridges between constructivism and other approaches and thereby overcome the big gap between rational and reflective views within international relations\(^6\), the lack of empirical proof and the difficulties in clear measuring within the field of normative studies is still a subject of discussion in contemporary studies of International Relations. This thesis tries to rely on the empirical proof received through in-depth interviews to measure the more abstract subjects of social studies like network emergence and norm development.

2.2 Introduction of Network and Norm Studies to Political Science

As mentioned earlier, one of the key elements of constructivism and of central importance to this thesis is the assumption of norms and networks within international relations. This chapter will both take a deeper look at norm studies as well as explain the theory of networks, since the aspect of norms is utterly important for the formation of networks and is therefore a big part of the priorities of this thesis.

A norm, in short, is an accepted standard of behavior among a group of actors. Literature on norms is broad and unfinished, but provides a wide variety of different norms and aspects. For example, many studies identify several types of norms: regulative norms, constitutive norms and evaluative/prescriptive norms.\(^7\) Other scholars have also distinguished between domestic and international norms, although both these forms of norms are interactively intertwined with each other as well.\(^8\)

\(^8\) Gest, Justin, Armstrong, Carolyn, Carolan, Elizabeth, Fox, Elliott, Holzer, Vanessa, McLellan, Tim, . . . Talib, Meher. 2013 (a)
described a normative theory as “that body of work which addresses the moral dimension of international relations and the wider questions of meaning and interpretation by the discipline.” In other words, normative theory plays a major role in explaining how come things to be, or how things ought to be in accordance with the idea of progress in international relations.

This emphasis on the idea of progress went against the dominant trends in international relations, which often emphasized empirical facts over moral speculations. In addition, international relations scholars were particularly skeptical of norms because they assumed that norms only emerge as a result of persuasion by charismatic individuals unfavorable circumstances rather than systematic, objective processes. In other words, they viewed norms as a purely subjective and arbitrary process that could not be studied objectively or scientifically.

However, new research in international relations sparked a ‘second wave’ that recognized how international norms affect state behavior through domestic political processes, which will be explored in more depth later on. From this second wave onwards, gradual progress has been made in admitting the role of norms in the international sphere. In particular, norms have been recognized as an important element of forming societies, which in turn has important implications for how these states interact on an international level. As Hedley Bull argued, states form a society as long as they can recognize common interests and values and “conceive themselves to be bound by a common set of rules… and share in the workings of common institutions.”

---

12 O'faircheallaigh, Ciaran. 2014. IR theory and domestic adoption of international norms. *International Politics*, 51(2), 155-176. p.156
A major influence on normative studies were Ann Marie Clark and Kathryn Sikkink with their well-known idea of a so-called “norm lifecycle” to show the progress of norm initiation and adaptation. They rely on a more “phased” approach for the emergence of so-called “principle norms” relating to human rights. They identify four phases for the emergence of human rights norms: 1) the discovery and interpretation of facts, 2) publication and discussion of those facts, 3) construction of discrete legal norms and 4) the application of newly created norms with regard to state behavior.  

(See figure below for reference.)

![Figure 1-2 Norm Lifecycle](image)


Finnemore and Sikkink claim that norm entrepreneurs act as catalysts in fostering norm emergence. Norm entrepreneurs are agents (individuals in Finnemore and Sikkink's view, but organizations and states can act as norm entrepreneurs as well) who, dissatisfied with the social context, use organizational platforms to spread alternative views about what ought to be done. Norm entrepreneurs work to persuade other agents to alter their behavior in accordance with the norm entrepreneur's ideas of what constitutes appropriate behavior. In many cases, norm socialization is said to occur when elite

---

nation-state bureaucrats (in the role of norm entrepreneurs) work in international bodies and become aware of issues cause bureaucrats to raise awareness about this issue to their own respective societies. This forms the idea of a network where the norm entrepreneurs are the initial spark to let the network emerge in their road to change normative behavior. These so-called ‘outside-in’ dynamics play an important part in norm adaptation.\textsuperscript{15} Finnemore and Sikkink claim that when a ‘critical mass’ of agents accepts the new ideas, a norm has emerged. According to them, this "critical mass" is roughly one third of the states and/or actors involved. In this sense, this will create a broader network with an even wider range of influence which can be used to generate social pressure among the remaining states and/or actors to conform to the newly introduced norm as well.\textsuperscript{16} This stage is called the ‘tipping point’. Another important factor that could lead to this tipping point in norm initiation is the role of a hegemonic power, as mentioned by Sikkink and Finnemore in a footnote (85). Even though of course the tipping point is seen as the most important part of the progress in changing a norm, this thesis argues that the emergence of a network is a far more challenging aspect and is the initial spark that causes the normative situation to change. The interests of the different norm entrepreneurs and their will to find cohesion with each other to form a network might be more often neglected in normative studies, but this thesis will prove through norm entrepreneurs who are directly involved with the case study that this development of a human rights network is of prominent use in creating this “norm lifecycle” by Sikkink and Finnemore.

Despite the intuitive notion that entrepreneurs play a role in establishing and altering normative structures, along with the plethora of insightful empirical work on this topic, constructivists have still been criticized for failing to precisely show how norm entrepreneurs actually influence norm dynamics. In particular, they have yet to definitively demonstrate how agents, following a logic of appropriateness (rather than economic rationality), might forge norms within the norm life cycle framework\textsuperscript{17}. Wylie also

\textsuperscript{17}Hoffman, Matthew. 2018. Entrepreneurs and Norm Dynamics: An Agent-Based Model of the Norm Life Cycle. Ph.D Dissertation. University of Delaware
emphasizes that the successful adaptation of a norm in politics depends not only on the efforts of norm entrepreneurs, but the material interests of the state as well.\textsuperscript{18} Thus, if a state does not adapt a norm, it may not necessarily mean that the moral persuasion of the norm entrepreneurs failed, but may simply be due to other factors.

Another criticism of the norm-based approach is that it focuses more on activists such as NGO’s instead of state actors; this paper will show that state actors too have a role to play in the norm lifecycle. Another criticism claims that this cycle only views international politics from the bottom up, neglecting the top-down promulgation of norms.\textsuperscript{19} Wylie insists that, when it comes to any form of human trafficking, one should prefer when read against a model of the norm lifecycle, which also takes points about politics inside and outside entrepreneurial communities and before and after norm adoption into account.\textsuperscript{20}

### 2.3 Evolution of Norm Studies in Political Science

Although the study on norms is nowhere near complete, fulfilled or entirely researched in present day, many so-called “waves” of scholarship have emerged. As a specific one of these waves will be used as a theoretical framework in this thesis, it is of utter importance to discuss the different types of waves there have been in research thus far. The first wave of scholarship on norms is build on, as Acharya mentions in her article \textit{How Ideas Spread: Whose Norms matter? Norm Localization and Institutional Change in Asian Regionalism}, the belief of moral cosmopolitanism.\textsuperscript{21} In other words: an ideology that all of human kind belong to a single community, far stronger than regional beliefs, cultures and traits.

\footnotesize\textsuperscript{18} Wylie, Gillian. 2016. \textit{The international politics of human trafficking}. Retrieved from https://ebookcentral.proquest.com p.38
\footnotesize\textsuperscript{19} Wylie, Gillian. 2016(a) p.11
\footnotesize\textsuperscript{20} Wylie, Gillian. 2016(b)
Acharya sums up three features of this first wave: First, the existing norms are ‘universal’. Second, the key actors who have the lead in spreading these norms are transnational agents. Lastly, this wave focuses heavily on norm conversion in the cosmopolitan context.22

However, this perspective has a few points worth of criticism as well: the literature on this topic tends to ignore the importance of other norms that are deeply rooted in one’s social entity, as for example in regional, national and sub national groups. Moreover, this viewpoint raises the class of the universal norms in comparison to the local or national norms, creating a bias to norms concerned in the cosmopolitan sphere. Another point of criticism is the fact that this view ignores the role of local actors, emphasizing the function of transnational agents.

A second wave on norm scholarship does not stress the international formula but focuses on the role of domestic political, organizational and cultural variables when it comes to the emergence of global norms as shortly mentioned in the previous sub-chapter.23 This perspective argues there is congruence between domestic and international norms. In other words, both categories of norms are able to influence and strengthen each other if there are similarities to be found and can therefore affect each other’s successes.

However, this viewpoint has its weak points as well: Although it has a bigger focus on the domestic area than the first wave on norm scholarship, the regional context has been left out. On top of that, this view can be one that is motionless – the systematic norms against the historically placed domestic ones – rather than a dynamic progress. Concepts like framing and grafting on the other hand, offer a much more changing process. Framing creates a field where norm entrepreneurs can highlight

23 Acharya, Amitav. 2004(a)
issues and increase the salience by naming, interpreting and dramatizing them. Grafting is a tactic that norm entrepreneurs can use to institutionalize a norm by comparing it to an already existing and similar norm. Apart from the scale of norms, the question also arose about which ideas actually matter in international relations and which norms actually shape state identities and interests.

The third wave of norms is all about localization. This third wave goes even further than the previous one. The outside norm needs to become congruent with a preexisting local norm in order to be established in the first place. For this process, it needs the same kind of framing and grafting as argued above, but might even need a whole reconstruction for it to be similar enough to the local one. At the same time, local actors are in this process far more important than outside actors. Acharya defines localization as “the active construction of foreign ideas by local actors, which results in the former developing of significant congruence with local beliefs and practices”. From a rationalist’s point of view, localization is simply easier for norms to be institutionalized. As the saying by Keohane goes, “it is easier to maintain and adapt existing institutions than to create new ones”.

The fourth wave of research on the study of norms is not focused on the scale and not focused on the reach or position of the norms that are about to be changed and/or institutionalized per se. This last wave focuses on the actors themselves, the so-called norm entrepreneurs. This will also be the theoretical framework that will mostly be used for this thesis. The argument on why there should be a need to concentrate on the norm entrepreneurs themselves is due to the fact that these actors can cross local, regional and national borders but, on the other hand, can bring back international normative orders to the local scale as well. Sikkink and Finnemore explain that there is a two-level norm game occurring in which

the domestic and the international norm tables are increasingly linked through the actors who want to amend the existing norms in a certain area. Norm entrepreneurs are the ones responsible for the initiation of the norm and creating awareness around it. They have to power to use international norms to boost their own authority on a local base as well as use locally accepted norms to ward of norms from the outside or make an effort to amend these international norms. Structuring a network that could make a start of the way to norm emergence has a critical role for the norm entrepreneurs. They are the ones that should persuade norm leaders to adapt new norms or change existing ones. As Finnemore and Sikkink further argue, these actors are also the ones behind the above mentioned type of ‘framing’ that is considered a good tactic to apply and institutionalize new norms.

Norm entrepreneurs frequently target one norm leader or individual state actors for criticism. Sikkink and Finnemore suggest that one way to think about norm entrepreneurs is that they provide the information ad publicity that provokes cognitive dissonance among norm violators. Norm leaders or state actors tend to care deeply about their international image as a human being, which makes it easier for norm entrepreneurs to pressure these actors by shaming them or any other method that will change their public image. Norm entrepreneurs will, when they are fighting for norms about equality and protecting vulnerable groups from bodily harm, have more transnational resonance than other norms. This explains why norm campaigns around slavery and women's suffrage have a far bigger success rate. The increase of globalization also aids norm entrepreneurs as it made it possible for a dramatic expansion of norms to occur; eventually leading to somewhat of a homogenization of global norms. Also, in these kinds of norm campaigns, a network is easier to set up since norm entrepreneurs involved can have a huge variety among their group as to why they are reaching out for a normative change. This will be further discussed in the following sub-chapter.

Finnemore, Martha, & Sikkink, Kathryn. 1998(a) p. 895
Finnemore, Martha, & Sikkink, Kathryn. 1998(b) p. 904
Finnemore, Martha, & Sikkink, Kathryn. 1998(c) p. 907
2.4 Recent Emphasis on Norm and Network Emergence in Political Science

This sub-chapter in the thesis will prove that there is a need within the studies of both networks and norms for a better understanding of the process of network emergence. This thesis aims to show that the analyses of the processes of the case study will have an important addition to the theoretical concerns around this subject and will frame its analysis in order to recognize and contribute to main theoretical issues in the focused debates in literature. This part first discusses why network emergence is important along with under what circumstances these networks are created. Later on, this thesis also delves deeper in how network emergence affects the further process of norm initiation.

The politics of network has been largely ignored by network theory despite the rise of the internet that allowed networks to gain new prominence.32 So far, most research suggests that so-called nodes within networks are of grave importance and are one of the deciding factors when it comes to the question whether a network will succeed in its quest or not.33 Since networks are voluntary, the nodes within these networks ought to gain something in order for them to remain within the network; otherwise there is a high chance for nodes to exit and leave.34 This thesis also aims to research what the returns therefore would be for the norm entrepreneurs of the North Korean labor case study through their motivations to join the network. Another thing to be noted when it comes to the emergence of networks is the conflicting preferences of actors both on norms and their own interests. It is important to keep in mind that networks emerge before a certain norm does; norms tend to ‘compete’ with each other during the progress of formulating a network as to see which norms are applicable and achievable and therefore tend to become more solid after the network has emerged successfully.35 This is one of the reasons why this thesis argues the importance of the emergence of a (human rights) network over the initiation of a specified norm. This

33 Lake, David A. and Wong, Wendy. 2007(a)
34 Lake, David A. and Wong, Wendy. 2007(b) p.5
35 Lake, David A. and Wong, Wendy. 2007(c) p.4
factor also explains that the delayed rise of a norm that has the probability to become successful suggests that actors deeper within the network (central nodes) have the ability to manipulate the structure of the network itself to their advantage as long as the norm is not yet established.\textsuperscript{36} Nodes within the network have each their different influence on political aspect and therefore it is possible to argue that the broader one makes its network (the more indirect nodes the networks join) the more effective this network will be. This thesis will describe in future chapters how these facts align with the case study. This makes apparent though, that the main factor why network emergence is important is due to the fact that, without this specified development of a network following through the structures of the leading main nodes, there will not be any forming of norm initiation. To put in different words, a norm initiative can only arise when a network has formed itself along the personal preferences of the inner nodes.

It is important to explain how network emergence influences the entire process of norm initiation as earlier discussed with the norm lifecycle of Finnemore and Sikkink. With the rise of Non-Governmental Organizations and important actors outside the boundaries of the state itself, the impact of international norms and (human rights) networks have been discussed frequently in modern debate. A key factor of norms in contemporary society is that networks in the involvement of normative change have been said as to have the power “to persuade, shame or praise actors into changing their policies.”\textsuperscript{37}Since norms, as already been talked about before, are directly linked to morality, non-governmental organizations that are mostly based on their principles, do have, as the saying goes, the moral high ground.

This argument has been supported by Clark in her book about Amnesty as an exemplary example of a human rights network as well as an NGO that changes politics in the international sphere. She states NGO’s have been effective to governments because of its status as a bystander with few resources except

Available at SSRN: https://ssrn.com/abstract=1004199 or http://dx.doi.org/10.2139/ssrn.1004199p.8
its principles, objectivity and information. Principles can be considered a key factor in the effectiveness of human right networks and their power to change politics. Therefore, as Kim argues in the article *World Health Organization and Early Global Response to HIV/AIDS: Emergence and Development of International Norms*, states can actually be shaped by normative concerns and concludes the article by stating that international organizations have the power to change policy of domestic governments via normative ways through human rights networks.

Checkel pushed this boundary even further by arguing that norms control not only the active (behavior) aspects of states but also their passive (identity) factors: He uses the study of Audie Klotz to back up his argument by stating “Audie Klotz argued in a study about apartheid in Africa that racial equality was at the heart of the solution: This demonstrates a constitutive role for norms, where they affect state identity and not only regulate behavior.” In this way, human rights network have the power to decide and change the identity of a state through normative discussion.

It is also important to not only cover the influence of networks as a general organ, but to also concentrate on so-called norm entrepreneurs. Norm entrepreneurs are actors who are trying to persuade political actors to adopt a norm that the norm entrepreneur is invested in. Numerous studies suggest that active and committed norm entrepreneurs, who raise problem awareness, construct a resonant framing, mobilize their audience, pressure the norm addressees, and create conducive institutional conditions, play a crucial role in norm emergence and the formation of a network. However, not all power resides in the norm entrepreneurs alone. For instance, Rosert argues in her article *Salience and the emergence of international norms: Napalm and cluster munitions in the inhumane weapons convention* that a high

---

salience, in contrast to low salience, facilitates norm emergence. Salience, as she claims, can stand on its own, but can be low or high depending on other factors. One of these factors is the presence of the media in determining the fate of public issues. Journalistic selection decisions based on the 'news vale' of an issue are also an important factor to salience. This ‘news value’ can increase if so-called triggering events (especially if these triggering events are unexpected and intense) are followed by a string of related events, producing a regular stream of new information. Thus, it is important to keep the highly influential role of the media in mind throughout the thesis.

*Figure 1-1 –Emergence of International Norms>*


According to Elvira Rosert, the steps to norm emergence may be depicted as shown in the Figure 1. If we observe the diagram, we see that norm entrepreneurs have the task of exerting social pressure on

---

actors with leverage, such as the public or other states. To this end, norm entrepreneurs can frame an issue in such a way that they cast their target in a negative light by exposing their norm-violating behavior and norm-rejecting attitudes, thereby blaming and sharing the supporters of the target. Media, as previously mentioned, aids norm entrepreneurs considerably by shining a spotlight on the topic and the people involved, thereby increasing the social pressure. Since the emergence of norms is not possible without social pressure, we see that norm entrepreneurs play a crucial role in the whole process.

This thesis will delve deeper into the role norms and networks can play in international networks and policies. Especially, it will research how a network emerges, why this is important in the matter of the case study, how it affected the case study and on what scale norms can actually play a role in changing policies both domestically as well as on an international level. An in-depth case study about North Korean laborers present in Europe and the reactions from multiple organizations will support the research of this thesis on the subject of norms and human rights networks.

CHAPTER III: NORTH KOREAN LABOR ISSUE IN EUROPE

This thesis has touched upon the most important aspects on norms and social networks in the literature review. With this as a background, this thesis will now continue to the main core of the research: the case study. After a detailed overview on the events and facts known about the case study, this thesis will proceed to the further developments involving this issue. This part will display facts and historical factors concerning the case study and examines the primary response of the media after the death of Chŏn Kyŏngsu. This will pave an introduction into the question as to how a spark to an initiative to norm emergence is created and will therefore add new insights to the field of norm studies within International Relations.

3.1 History and Facts on North Korean Labor in Europe

The Democratic People’s Republic of Korea (henceforth referred to as the “DPRK”) tops the Prevalence Index Rank with an estimated 1.1 million people currently being coerced into slavery.⁴⁶ 50,000⁴⁷ of them live abroad in over 40 different countries.⁴⁸ The vast majority of them work in China, Russia, the Middle East and Africa.⁴⁹ Although North Koreans reside in more than 40 foreign countries, this thesis will focus on the European countries only. As of recent times the European Union (from now on EU) seems to be a new hotspot for North Korean laborers to migrate to and getting employment. The

---

most important reason for this is the fact that EU countries tend to have higher wages.\textsuperscript{50} The number one destination for most North Korean laborers is Poland but, as stated in the rapport \textit{Slaves to the System}, it does not stop at Poland but is spread across the whole of Europe.\textsuperscript{51} North Korean migrant laborers are typically granted work visas for Eastern European countries such as the Czech Republic, Bulgaria, and Romania. However, they occasionally can end up working in Central European countries like Germany and the Netherlands.\textsuperscript{52} In addition, countries like Austria (104-111 laborers as by data in 2014 and 2015)\textsuperscript{53} but also Malta, Romania and Sweden seem to have a high number of North Korean laborers active within their boundaries.\textsuperscript{54}

After ChǒnKyǒngsu's case was covered by the media through a documentary from VICE and Leiden University released a full and massive rapport with detailed information, there was pressure to investigate the issue further. In 2015, political actors became involved and three members of the European Parliament broached this subject for the first time in recent memory: Kati Piri and Agnes Jongerius representing the Netherlands, as well as Germany’s Thomas Händel. These leaders urged the EU to take action to protect North Koreans in Europe against the harsh conditions they faced.\textsuperscript{55} Piri, Jongerius, and Händel have remained at the forefront, calling for action to improve North Korean immigrants’ labor conditions.

There has now been mounting pressure on countries that host North Korean laborers, some of which will now be elaborated on. The most noteworthy of these countries is Malta, the country MEP

\textsuperscript{50}Batha, Emma. 2016. North Korea Sends Hundreds Of ‘State-Sponsored Slaves’ To Europe: Rights Group. Retrieved from https://www.huffingtonpost.com/entry/north-korea-slavery_us_577d0ef0e4b09b9be43c1ab0 (accessed on 2018-04-22)
\textsuperscript{51}Breuker, Remco, Gardingen, Imke, Boonen, Marte, Boonstra, Klara, Chung, Christine, Kim, Kwang-cheol, Veere, Anoma. 2017. \textit{Slaves to the system: North Korean forced labour in the European Union, the Polish case: How the supply of a captive DPRK workforce fits our demand for cheap labour.} p. 11
\textsuperscript{52}Breuker, Remco, Gardingen, Imke, Boonen, Marte, Boonstra, Klara, Chung, Christine, Kim, Kwang-cheol, Veere, Anoma. 2017(a) p. 11, p. 25
\textsuperscript{53}Breuker, Remco, Gardingen, Imke, Boonen, Marte, Boonstra, Klara, Chung, Christine, Kim, Kwang-cheol, Veere, Anoma. 2017(b) p. 11, p. 25
\textsuperscript{54}Batha, Emma. 2016. North Korea Sends Hundreds Of ‘State-Sponsored Slaves’ To Europe: Rights Group. Retrieved from https://www.huffingtonpost.com/entry/north-korea-slavery_us_577d0ef0e4b09b9be43c1ab0 (accessed on 2018-04-22)
Thomas Händel singled out to illustrate the plight of North Korean workers (as will later be explained in the thesis) since it has over 200 laborers from North Korea. Most of them are active in textiles or construction industries. When the ETC (Employment and Training Cooperation) provided figures claiming that the amount of North Korean laborers in the company called Leisure Clothing had tripled since 2013, the company denied all accusations and stated they were not aware of the presence of North Korean workers in Malta.\textsuperscript{56}

In contrast to clear evidence of North Korean laborers in the Malta, there is no clear data or study about the number of North Koreans in Italy. Italy, unlike most European countries, has had a history of friendly ties with North Korea. In 2000, it was the first Western country to be opening diplomatic relations with the idea of being an “ice-breaker” in international affairs.\textsuperscript{57} This pact is still active as of today. Apart from these facts, Italy is also one of the few countries with a North Korean embassy in their capital city. In Europe, there are a total of ten North Korean embassies, with Italy being one of them.\textsuperscript{58}\textsuperscript{59}

However, in recent times the Italian government has asked the North Korean ambassador to leave the country due to the new sanctions of the UN against North Korea.\textsuperscript{60}\textsuperscript{61}


\textsuperscript{59}On a small side note, it is interesting to see that the countries in Europe which have significant numbers of laborers from North Korea are also some of the few countries in Europe that have a North Korean embassy within their borders. As stated earlier, Italy, Austria, Bulgaria, Czech Republic, Germany, Poland, Romania, Sweden, Switzerland and United Kingdom as well all host a resident North Korean embassy.


When it comes to the Czech Republic, there is little research that suggests that in that country alone there are over 300 female workers from North Korea to this day. Most of these women are between eighteen and twenty-two years old. However, the article by Jelinkova concludes that it is difficult to know their true situation for sure since they mostly seem to be locked away behind their doors and ‘protected’ by guards. These women, upon asked about their living environment by above mentioned scholar, were reluctant to answer and quickly went inside their respective homes.

3.2 Media Attention to the North Korean Labor Issue

The issue of North Korean laborers in Europe was brought to public attention after an alarming event a few years back. In 2014, a North Korean man in Poland arrived in a local hospital with severe burns covering 95% of his body. He had been working in a Polish shipyard for years, six days a week and for twelve hours a day. One day his cheap and highly flammable synthetic welding overalls caught on fire and, due to the absence of any supervision, he was sent to the hospital too late and died the day after he was brought in. These overalls were given to him by Armex, a Polish company that is indirectly co-owned by Polish entities and North Koreans. This North Korean, who went by the name of ChŏnKyŏngsu (전경수), was paid below minimum wage, did not have a labor contract, and had his passport taken away from him by his North Korean supervisor upon arriving in Poland. When these facts were uncovered, it was almost impossible to grasp the living conditions of this North Korean laborer in Poland. Such circumstances clearly fall under the definitional framework of forced labor, or, in layman’s terms, slavery.

---

63Breuker, Remco, Gardingen, Imke, Boonen, Marte, Boonstra, Klara, Chung, Christine, Kim, Kwang-cheol, ...Veere, Anoma. 2017. Slaves to the system: North Korean forced labour in the European Union, the Polish case: How the supply of a captive DPRK workforce fits our demand for cheap labour.
It is important to begin by referring to the established definition of “forced labor” from the International Labor Office as “work [that] was involuntary as a result of force, fraud or deception, and a penalty or threat of a penalty was used to coerce them or their parents in the case of children below the age of 18.” When researching whether or not there is a human rights infringement in the case of the North Korean immigrant laborers in the EU, such a definition can be used as an evaluative metric, though it is somewhat subjective.

The United Nations’ International Covenant on Civil and Political Rights (ICCPR) and the International Covenant on Economic, Social and Cultural Rights (ICESCR) have enumerated specific rights that pertain to this realm of discussion: Article 8 of ICCPR states, “No one shall be required to perform forced or compulsory labor.” Other ICCPR articles contain mentions of the following rights: liberty of movement; freedom to choose one’s residence; freedom from subjection to arbitrary and unlawful interference with one’s privacy, family, home or correspondence; freedom of thought, conscience and religion; to hold opinions without interference; as well as the freedom of expression, peaceful assembly, and association. ICESCR outlines similar rights to work and the prohibition of forced labor. These rights include access to fair wages, safe and healthy working conditions and an adequate standard of living. The EU has aligned itself with the aforementioned rights, consistently expressing emphatic support for both the prohibition of slavery and the right to fair and just working conditions. These laws apply to any form of migrant labor and ought to be enacted as implemented by both employers and employees.

Documentary makers such as VICE and institutions as Leiden University have been trying to shed light on the issue of North Korean migrant laborers in the EU. VICE was able to reach a wide

---


audience with their documentary since it is an influential media source within Europe. In 2015, Leiden University, led by Professor Remco Breuker, released a report that shed light on the brutal conditions of North Korean laborers, showing that they are not protected by the laws mentioned above. Upon arrival, their passports are seized by their supervisors. As a result of being prohibited from leaving their domicile, they are effectively isolated from their colleagues at work and at home. Their families are held hostage back in North Korea in order to ensure adherence to the rules. They do not directly receive wages or even have the slightest knowledge about their earnings. The average immigrant worker from the DPRK works about 11-12 hours a day, six days a week without any paid holidays. Moreover, 90 percent of their earnings are sent back to North Korea. In total, their earnings generate around 1.2 – 2.3 billion USD in hard currencies. In short, the report helped expose the exploitative conditions under which North Koreans worked in Europe.

This report forced the European Parliament to produce an official notice in response to the issue. Even after successfully garnering significant media attention over the past few years, in recent memory the debate has begun to simmer. As a result, the aforementioned issues remain unresolved. Organizations such as Human Rights Without Frontiers (HRWF) have repeatedly brought this matter to the attention of the EU but their protests have basically fallen on deaf ears. It was only after the three previously mentioned parliament members spoke up that Malta declared it would no longer issue working permits to the North Korean laborers. At least for a while, their efforts helped make the issue of North Korean migrant laborers a hot topic throughout Europe.

---

This does show however that the initiation of norm is sparked by media attention and thereby gains attention from future norm entrepreneurs. Within the field of norm studies, this case study so far proved how media and normal action are intertwined and often support each other by raising mutual awareness. This so far returns to the point of Elvira Rosert in stating media and norm entrepreneurs have to exist side to side in order to let a norm initiation thrive in the early stages of norm emergence.

The next sub-chapter delves into the progress that has been made through this first spark of media attention surrounding this issue. It describes the actions and efforts of the norm entrepreneurs active in this issue until the situation as of now.

3.3 Developments in North Korean Labor in Europe

As a result of the report from Leiden University, Thomas Händel, German MEP and Chair of the EU Parliamentary Committee on Employment and Social Affairs, tried to raise attention about the exploitation of North Korean laborers in Malta by sending letters to a number of EU agencies. In these letters, he refers to the report from Leiden University and stresses the dire situation of the North Korean laborers and what this means for the European Union, which purports to be a beacon of human equality and freedom. This action, unlike other attempts, were considerably successful: Firstpost writes that in 2016 Malta denied visa extensions for 20 North Korean laborers who had been employed at a construction firm and clothing manufacturer, effectively expelling them from the country. Although this may seem like a small number, this event seems like it was one of the most important successes of the

---

norm entrepreneurs in this case study so far. However, it is still difficult to obtain clear and hard data on the exact numbers of North Koreans that have either left or were being reinforced from the country.

A few months later, Kati Piri and Agnes Jongerius, also both members of the European Parliament, wrote a parliamentary question about North Korean laborers in the EU. They also relied on the strong evidence provided by VICE and Leiden University and called for measures to be taken to prevent this form of slavery within the EU. However, as later on will be told in more detail in the next sub-chapter, these attempts were barely successful. The answers from the commission of Brussels were vague and more or less dodging any clear answers backed up by proof and data. With support from both Leiden University and Piri and Jongerius, HRWF has raised the issue of exploited North Korean laborers in Poland at the Organization for Security and Cooperation in Europe’s (OSCE) conference in Warsaw. Although it did draw a certain amount of media attention, progress or decisions on the subject have not been made after the conference.

After constant pressure through the written questions and conferences and articles by both HRWF and Reuters, the first country in Europe to respond was Poland. New Europe published an article in 2016 stating, “Research suggests that for years the EU tolerates North Korean slave labor in several member states, including Malta, the Netherlands, the Czech Republic, Bulgaria, Romania, and Poland…In 2015 alone, Poland issued 156 visas and 482 work permits for North Korean laborers. Partly as a result of a South Korean global campaign to end the practice, Poland has not issued new visas in 2016, Reuters recently reported.” However, according to the HRWF, the latest official statistics available on the website of the Polish government indicate that 180 work permits were granted to North Korean citizens in

---

76 Human Rights Without Frontiers. 2016(a)
2016. 

Seen from this point, no clear solution or change has been made through the efforts of the above-mentioned non-governmental organizations HRWF and Reuters, supported by pressure from journalistic parties.

Sometime later, after another request by the previously mentioned members of the European Parliament, a national policy change was introduced by several governments within and beyond the EU region. Ukraine and Qatar also withdrew numerous visa deals and sent 200 North Korean laborers back to their home country. Despite these separate measures on national level, data shows it remains an ongoing challenge to fully control North Korean forced labor in Europe. As of early 2018, the New York Times disclosed that there are still many North Korean laborers residing in the EU, including 450 in Poland alone.

This shows that the multiple attempts of norm entrepreneurs like Leiden University, HRWF and the three MEPs are not as successful as one might wish. HRWF and Leiden University both managed to raise awareness about this issue and raised the idea of a first interpretation of a fitting norm. However, their reach did not go far enough to implement their norms within the boundaries of the European Union. The norm entrepreneurs who could be regarded as being able to make a change within the European policy would be Piri, Jongerius and Händel of the European Parliament, since they have the political reach and would therefore have a broader influence on the political situation within the boundaries of the European Union.

Up to the present day, Professor Remco Breuker has released three different versions of the rapport on the issue of North Korean laborers in Europe. Along with the released versions, Leiden

---

University organizes several times a year lectures and information sessions on this topic, all of them hosted by Breuker himself. Along with information on the rapports, the documentary of VICE called *Cash for Kim* and North Korean activists like Jang Jin-sung have been presented as well to an audience full of interested visitors and a variety of media. Breuker is as of now still working on this project and hopes to increase awareness surrounding it, but has of lately been met with difficult issues on financial level. Due to warnings from companies such as Samsung and even the South Korean government, the funding needed for research in this issue has been suspended for an unknown period of time. This might be because of the recent change in policy by president Moon Jae-in of South Korea. Leiden University still hopes to regain the media attention it got a few years back, but is waiting for an opportune moment to step in. Instead of concentrating on lectures and new research for the report *Slaves to the System*, Breuker has recently released a new book called *De B.V. Noord Korea – Een kernmacht in de marge* (roughly translated as LLC North Korea – A Nuclear Power on the Rise). In this book, he describes in a detailed way both his personal passion and motives towards research on the topic of North Korea as well as a comprehensive summary of the exploitation of North Korean migrant workers present in Europe and in other parts of the world.81

Even with the effort of all the different groups such as Leiden University, Human Rights Without Frontiers, Reuters, Remco Breuker, VICE, European media, Thomas Händel, Agnes Jongerius and Kati Piri as Members of the European Parliament, the situation is still a far way from being resolved. Not too long ago, a North Korean active in Poland sued a European shipbuilding company for profiting from his “slavery”.82 According to the article, Dr. Gearoid O Cuinn, director of the Global Legal Action Network, is urging that this case needs to remind us that more needs to be done in Europe, it seems Europe is still slow to action. Some parties claim that the present sanctions of the UN in which Europe is participating

---

should be sharpened; however, other parties argue that the sanctions are part of the reason why the modern slavery of North Korean laborers has been thrived. Moon Jae-in, current president of South Korea, is currently pursuing a policy of decreasing tensions towards North Korea: Recently, he has even requested Europe to ease sanctions on North Korea in order to encourage peace and prosperity on the peninsula.

In the meantime, Jongerius and Piricannot play a large role. They argued the present absence of media and journalistic pressure is holding them back from taking any action. As previously mentioned, the European Labor Inspection could turn the tables to a certain degree at least, but, while it may take time for it to be actually established, it will also be only one of many solutions where it is even doubtful whether they will work or not. In order to get to the second stage of the so-called norm life-cycle by Finnemore and Sikkink, at least one third of the states involved have sign up for the new norm to be adapted. As of now, Europe has a long way to go if it needs to reach a minimum of thirty percent. Jongerius was hoping a similar trigger as the documentary of VICE would happen again and that this would create a new spark of interest in the issue. Although a second documentary has been made on the subject, apart from a screening at the European commission and on BBC central, it has not received a considerable amount of attention.

On the contrary, it may seem like the “modern slavery” of North Korea only gets worse by the day: The 2018 Global Slavery Index posted quite recently a new ground-breaking record with a number of 2.6 million North Koreans living in slavery. In other words, this means 1 out of 10 North Koreans is

---


forced to work. As previously said, the presence of sanctions could increase the need for North Korea to send out its people in order to work to make up for the financial losses that ensue from the sanctions of the UN. Although they may not all be present in Europe, it seems as of this year that there has been a substantial increase in overseas North Korean laborers in China and Russia. Russia in particular has been gaining more than 10,000 North Korean laborers in 2018 alone.

This makes one wonder whether the past efforts of all the people involved have actually aided in some way to the situations of the North Korean laborers present all around the world. Making this issue more public through media and political involvement as well as augmenting sanctions might actually have been one of the reasons the North Korean regime got stricter with their overseas work and the amount of people involved in this. Nowadays, even the media in Europe now and then still covers an article about new revelations or information involving the situation of this case study, a new effort for involvement has not yet started to occur. To put it differently, even though people all over Europe and in other parts of the world are now aware of the livelihood of these thousands of North Koreans, it seems there is a further lack of involvement due to the trigger that has already been sparked, but has not succeeded.

However, it seems the year 2018 is also the time the world started to increase its focus on North Korea. Along with the ‘soft approach’ policy of present president Moon Jae-in who aims for “easing tensions on the divided peninsula through dialogue”, the rest of the world has started their own policy when it comes to North Korea: The UN started to increase the scale of their sanctions against North Korea since late 2017 and even Russia and China, seen as the countries with the most linkage to North Korea, gave their approval to keep up the maximum pressure on the North Korean regime. The UN has imposed

---

economic sanctions targeting up to 90% of North Korea’s trade revenues since 2016 for its repeated violations of resolutions prohibiting it from launching ballistic missiles and conducting nuclear tests.  

Only a few days after the UN adapted their new sanctions, the European Union joined the board as well. These sanctions have been active since 2016 until present day and are in a constant progress: The recent developments involving Kim Jong-un, Moon Jae-in and Trump and their prospective summits gave motive to the EU to pressure sanctions to decrease chances for nuclear weapon development. Not only does this development lower the possibility of future nuclear advancement in North Korea, this strict attitude also indirectly influences the international laborers of North Korea residing in Europe. The European Union, as a means of cutting off the cash flow towards North Korea, also wants to repatriate the North Koreans working abroad by the year 2020. However, as this thesis will later closely describe, the question remains whether these sanctions and agreements will make a real difference on the livelihood and presence of North Korean laborers in Europe. Although the European Union conveys a message through their new approach to North Korea, the opinions are divided whether this message will be maintained within European boundaries.

Another insight on the North Korean migrant laborers is provided by the new series *WHY SLAVERY*, a six-part documentary about modern slavery throughout the whole world. According to their argument, it is doubtful whether the European Union has the actual ability and supervision to know what is going on within its borders. The first part of the documentary called *North Korea’s Secret Slaves: Dollar Heroes* was launched in October 2018 at the European Parliament in Brussels. The documentary

---


travels from Russia to China to Poland and investigates the livelihood of the North Koreans working mostly day and night with an income of less than 150 USD a month. Although the overall series was a big tumult in the world of journalism, the media reacted explicitly about the way European recruiters and mediums between mostly companies of ship building and housing construction and the laborers advertised the North Koreans in favor of Polish workers: “North Koreans are far more diligent. Polish workers want the weekend off and go out drinking. North Koreans never complain; they always come.” A few minutes later in the documentary a North Korean laborer conveys in secret that drinking is the only thing he does on Sundays he is off; he “will not survive otherwise”. A lot of European newspapers urged the European Union to enhance their surveillance on the North Korean “slaves” within the EU, stating this is as important as keeping North Korea from developing nuclear weapons.

Even though the media remains interested in this issue, it still is difficult to tell if there will be rapid changes in the livelihood of the North Koreans in Europe any time soon. This thesis has thus far tried to give a detailed progress of the emergence of the awareness around the chosen study case, the background information on the case and how this case study became an issue within international politics; explicitly within the boundaries of the European Union. The next chapter will focus purely on the development of the reception of those involved with this issue and will combine those observations with the examined research within the field of norms in international relations.

---

CHAPTER IV: NORM ENTREPRENEURS IN THE EMERGENCE OF NORTH KOREAN LABOR ISSUE

This chapter will discuss the identity of the norm entrepreneurs who are involved in this issue and how and why they got involved. Not only non-governmental organizations like Human Rights Without Frontiers (HRWF) and Leiden University, but also the political motivations of three members of the European Parliament will be explained in further detail through articles and personal interviews. This paper, more than to achieve a result of those involved that would contribute to the study on norms and networks, aims to demonstrate an example of the progress of network emergence and the actions that could be taken by the norm entrepreneurs, whether these actions deem to be successful or not. Human rights activists are only able to build a network through a conversion of similar motivations and wanted results in their struggle to change the present situation. This thesis will show that the backgrounds and motivations for the three key actors are all quite different but will also end up in showing that through a conversion of common goals, this network around the situation of North Korean migrant labor in Europe had the possibility to be established and have settled on a specified norm which they hope will change the contemporary situation.

4.1 Identification of Key Entrepreneurs

This sub-chapter gives a short introduction of the norm entrepreneurs who played a key role in the issue of North Korean labor in Europe. The leading actors are as follows: Remco Breuker with a
research team from Leiden University, Human Right Without Frontiers, VICE and the three members of European Parliament who played a crucial part: Agnes Jongerius, Kati Piri and Thomas Händel.

Leiden University was the pioneer when it comes to discovering this issue in the first place and raising awareness ever after. Remco Breuker, a well-known professor in the field of North Korean Studies, who reacted as soon as ChŏnKyŏngsu (전경수) passed away in the hospital. Often appearing in Dutch and even international media, Breuker tries to raise attention to his stance on North Korea as a country that should be treated carefully and exposes the abuse of human rights within the country. Directly after the incident, he started a research on the issue of North Korean migrant laborers in Europe and released very soon after his first version of *Slaves to the System* that sparked immediate attention.

VICE came in shortly after Breuker started his research with the documentary *Cash for Kim* as a result of the death of the North Korean migrant laborer. Featuring Breuker in the documentary as well, VICE tried to depict the situation of North Korean laborers in Europe and filmed some scenes on the ship building construction site as well. The documentary got a screening at the first lecture of Breuker at Leiden University in 2015 about this issue.

Human Rights Without Frontiers (HRWF) is a non-governmental organization concerning human right all over the world. After previous mentioned norm entrepreneurs Leiden University and VICE, HRWF has been taking a key role in this issue by raising attention through both media and conventions all over Europe. They often recite the first rapport of Leiden University and use the material and proof found in VICE’s documentary as well to raise attention to not only the general public, but also political actors.
Last but not least, three members of the European Parliament played a huge role in raising awareness around this issue and asking critical questions through both media and political tools: Jongerius, Piri and Händel. There are some other members who have written Parliamentary Questions about the North Korean migrant labor issue; however, they have not appeared in any news article, report of the HRWF, Reuters or other organizations. Moreover, these other Members of the European Parliament are part of the (S&D) the same party as Jongerius and Piri,\(^{95}\) leading to a hypothesis that these members are encouraged by either one of them to help gain attention to this issue. Moreover, their Written Questions are not surrounding the issue of North Korean laborers within the EU, but concerning Mongolia and other Third Countries.\(^{96}\) There has not been any report or article concerning these other members. Therefore, this thesis will focus on the foremost active three members mentioned above. A short introduction of the background of them is as follows:

Agnes Jongerius started her political career as a member of the Labor Party in the Netherlands before she worked at the European Parliament. Moreover, she has been active for more than 20 years at the FNV; a Dutch federation of Trade Unions. Today she is, apart from being a member of the S&D, also Vice-Chair of the Committee on Employment and Social Affairs (EMPL) and a member of the Delegation for relations with the countries of Southeast Asia and the Association of Southeast Asian Nations (ASEAN) (DASE).

Kati Piri is, as Agnes Jongerius, active at the Dutch Labor party and is up to today a member of the S&D. Apart from this, she is foremost active in Committees on the issues surrounding Human Rights and Foreign Affairs. As opposed to her counterpart Agnes Jongerius who is more active on the field of labor, Kati Piri concerns herself more with human rights.

\(^{95}\) The members are as follows: Christel Schaldemose (S&D), Doru-Claudian Frunzulică (S&D) and Elena Valenciano (S&D). Also, one question by MarietjeSchaake (ALDE) from the Netherlands has been uploaded. However, this concerns more the trade-aspect of the North Korean laborers situation; not the apparent issue of ‘slave labor’.

Thomas Händel, before he worked at the European Parliament, was a Co-founder and executive secretary of the WASG (Electoral Alternative Labor and Social Justice). Within the European Parliament he is a member of the GUE/NGL and is the Chair at the EMPL as well as a member of DASE; both are committees Jongerius is also active in.

This thesis explores how these three members of the European Parliament got involved in the issue surrounding forced North Korean labor in the EU. The main point it seeks to entangle are as follows: which organizations or institutions searched for involvement from the members, how and through what way they approached these parliament members and how these three members stood up for this issue. This will help to give a clear identification on how a human rights network is established and how this can help in the spreading of a certain norm through a political sphere. Although one could say that there has not yet been a clear settlement on this issue, the progress that these members of the European Parliament and their allied institutions have had in this matter is of substantial importance to research related to emergence of norms and networks in international policy. Before this thesis will discuss the provided interviews, it will first concentrate on giving a more detailed close-up of the direct actions these members have taken after this issue became known to them.

4.2 What are the motivations of these norm entrepreneurs to become involved in this issue?

This sub-chapter will explain the motivations of why these key role actors wished to involve themselves and put effort in this issue. Although Breuker and HRWF can simply be answered in a sentence, this part will mostly focus on why the members of European Parliament used their name and
status in order to make a standpoint. A lot of the motivations and the way these norm entrepreneurs engaged in this issue is in accordance to the latest revelations in the field of norm studies as will be shown in this part of the chapter. Even though these motivations of these key actors will prove to be very different in nature, these interviews will show that these different motivations were slowly altered and transformed into a main demand of the human rights network when it comes to the North Korean migrant labor case. Since Händel was not able to be interviewed due to a sick leave, this paper uses only the firsthand interviews done with Breuker, Jongerius and Piri.

Breuker claimed that his whole career as a professor in the field of North Korean studies was always most involved with the aspects of North Korean human rights in and outside of the country itself. The death of ChŏnKyŏngsu gave enough motivation and media attention to start taking some genuine action.

The documentary of VICE was the main motivation for Jongerius to start to undertake action for this issue. Her main argument being that the European Union (Brussels) likes to play the high horse in political environments, but is purposely neglecting this dire fact that contradicts everything the European Union stands for. She argues as well that the moral high ground of the European Union would be more believable if it was willing to address and correct its own issues. This sincerity would also lead to a more convincing argument when the European Union tries to adjust the behavior of other countries in the world. This summary of arguments can be directly related back to research on the study of norms: According to Finnemore and Sikkink, the major motives for norm entrepreneurs to engage in related issues are empathy, altruism and/or ideational commitment. In the case of Jongerius, this thesis argues she took up this issue

---

with both an altruistic motive as well with an ideational commitment, considering her way of saying we “first need to remove the log in our own eyes before we remove the speck from the eyes of others”.

According to Kristen Monroe, altruism prevails when actors actually take "action designed to benefit another even at the risk of significant harm to the actor's own well-being." She continues that the core of altruism is a "shared perception of common humanity and a very simple but deeply felt recognition that we all share certain characteristics and are entitled to certain rights, merely by virtue of our common humanity." On the other hand, ideational commitment is followed through when norm entrepreneurs believe in the ideals and values embodied in the norm, even though they themselves are not directly affected by it. However, Jongerius fears that the European Union might try to avoid shedding any more light on an already embarrassing and difficult situation, making the European Union and the commission of Brussels more likely to shy away from their responsibilities altogether.

The issue of North Korean laborers in Europe was able to combine the visions of both Jongerius who is active on the field of labor norms, as well as Piri who is involved in human rights. Both of their main motivations to address this issue again is their argument that the European Union in fact is still not a “perfect” place where issues on the fields of human and labor rights are always handled perfectly. Jongerius believes the term “slaves” that Breuker uses in his rapport *Slaves to the System* is the proper word to refer to the situation of the North Korean laborers in Europe.

Jongerius and Piri both have a specific type of method to induce an emergence of norms that can be traced back into research as well: Hirsch mentions in his article three different types that are likely to make a practice on the emergence of norms more persuasive: Ideational change in expected returns,
ideational change in values and identity, and specification.\textsuperscript{100} The category Jongerius and Piri would fall into would be the second one: ideational change in values and identity. This type describes an “elevation of the normative status of a practice and expanding the range of identities it is associated with; thereby, attaching more positive moral values and desired identity to the practice and/or to the actors who adopt the practice. In the same vein, a moral degradation may be associated with the non-adoption of a practice and of those who do not adopt it when deemed appropriate.”\textsuperscript{101} Jongerius and Piri use the issue of the North Korean laborers as a leverage to plaster an image of moral degradation on the European Union. This is in accordance to Jongerius’ earlier said words about the EU playing the moral high horse mentioned before.

This can be considered “framing” as well, previously mentioned by Sikkink and Finnemore.\textsuperscript{102} Instead of referring to the North Korea laborers in a more objective way, Piri, Jongerius and Händel too have all used the term “slaves” when talking about this issue. This word, which has an extremely negative connotation, was a provocative term that probably made more impact on both the media as well as the people of the European Union. After Jongerius met Breuker at a conference, he asked her whether she would be willing to write the introduction for his upcoming second version of his rapport. This meeting, along with the attention the rapport of Breuker gained from the media, led to the initiative of both Piri and Jongerius to get back to the parliamentary written questions about the issue. They both felt the answers of Miss Thyssen on their previous tries have been less than satisfactory and that they needed to mount more pressure on Brussels concerning this subject.

The written questions along with public remarks towards the European Union on their minimal steps of action against this issue (for example when Händel drew attention to the case of North Korean


\textsuperscript{101}Hirsch, M. B.-J. 2014(a) p.815

laborers in Malta\textsuperscript{103}, are both an example of how norm entrepreneurs can expose norm-violating behavior and put the norm addressees in a negative light.\textsuperscript{104} Piri states that it is the role of Brussels to address member states of the European Union on their domestic policies; written questions is therefore one of the few things members of the European Parliament can do in order to spread awareness within Europe. She explained that there is also room for organizing conferences regarding this issue; this could lead to an eventual connection to the commission answering the written questions.

This is in accordance with Sikkink and Finnemore's theory, who argue that norm entrepreneurs require organizational platforms from which they can promote their norms.\textsuperscript{105} In comparison to NGO’s like Human Rights Without Frontiers (HRWF) or Leiden University, members of the European Parliament have a significant range of influence. Although the research of Leiden University received a lot of attention from the media, political action remains easier for member of the European Parliament to accomplish. One other important factor that helps for this issue to take it to politicians is the fact that the European Parliament has the facilities and the budget to actually get into action. Since NGO’s are often dependent on funds, their capacity is limited.

The main question, however, is whether there is actually a role for Brussels to be played in this issue, as it could also be within the responsibilities of the member states. Jongerius follows along the line of Piri’s words and emphasizes that this issue is an exceptional hard case since it plays on multiple levels: The fact that Poland is a member state makes it difficult to interfere through harder ways; making it limited on what to do. On the other hand, the European has no trade treaties with North Korea at all, making it difficult to interfere in that aspect too. In this point of view, this issue concerning North Korean


laborers is an interesting test to see what is within the abilities of the European Union. On top of that, even though the UN is the leading actor when it comes to sanctions against North Korea, the fact that this issue is present within the European boundaries can be considered a reason as to why the US is not (yet) very actively involved in this topic. As mentioned before, it might take the extra help of a hegemonic power to push norm adoption through.\footnote{Finnemore, M., & Sikkink, K. 1998. International Norm Dynamics and Political Change. \textit{International Organization}, 52(4), 887–917. Retrieved from \url{http://www.jstor.org.libproxy.snu.ac.kr/stable/2601361p.901}} Unfortunately, on the European platform, Jongerius and Piri have discovered that although their reach is a lot broader than most NGO’s and other organizations, they are still lacking the instruments to make the awareness on a fitting norm successful. It remains difficult to reach an impact within the European Parliament if there is no adequate pressure from the media or the citizens of the European Union demanding a change in how things on the aspects of Human rights and Labor rights are treated.

As for future developments, both Jongerius and Piri hope that the media and journalists will yet again pay attention to the issue of North Korean laborers and thereby help take political action as well. They state it is difficult to change something in politics if there is no focus from the media involved in it as well. Something like the documentary of VICE would help to bring things back in the spotlight again.

An often recurring item throughout this sub-chapter was the idea of framing by Finnemore and Sikkink. Jongerius saw a clear contradiction between the moral image the European Union displays and the reality that has been proven to be worse through this specific case on the subject of labor and human rights. Piri on the other hand, was motivated through contradictions in the aspect of labor rights within the European Union. Together, they formed a union that concentrated on the contradiction of the human rights and labor rights the European Union maintain, but apparently not carry out. This is a slight transformation of demands through a convergence of the appeals of both actors.
4.3 Emergence of the Network on North Korean Labor Issue

This last sub-chapter is concerned with how the key entrepreneurs were involved with the issue in the first place. It is already known that Breuker as a pioneer started raising awareness and featured in VICE’s documentary as well in order to gain more attention towards this issue. This part will mostly be about how the members of European Parliament got involved and by whom. Again, this thesis will show that the origination of involvement of the key factors was quite various, but had one strong point in common that will be in alignment with the previously discussed literature.

Jongerius and Piri have both been approached in different settings. Although Leiden University played a big role later in this issue, the first encounters with this case have been through other sources. Piri told about a two-week training for human rights defenders that was organized by the Dutch Ministry of Foreign Affairs. During this training, she met a woman who was part of a non-governmental organization in South Korea and was the first one to tell Piri about the issue of exploitation of North Korean workers in Europe. This woman requested Piri to organize and host a convention within the European Parliament where this issue would have its audience. Piri successfully organized this convention resulting in a big audience and a speaker from North Korea who had the experience of working in Europe itself. The woman asked Piri for help since she feared the influence of an NGO would only be limited compared to what a political spokesman would be able to do within a political atmosphere as well. This stresses the point that norm entrepreneurs can have the broad reach of not only local and/or domestic, but can even cross borders and become international influencers.\(^\text{107}\) On top of that, it follows

according to the argument of Sikkink and Finnemore that norm entrepreneurs have the power to bring along issues from an international level to a domestic level, the so-called ‘outside-in’ dynamic.\textsuperscript{108}

For Jongerius, the first interaction with this issue was through the earlier mentioned documentary of VICE called \textit{Cash for Kim} in early 2016. This documentary was made after the tragic incident involving ChŏnKyŏngsu and this event was also the incentive for VICE to make this documentary. VICE is a digital media and broadcasting company and therefore treated in this thesis as a form of media. \textit{Cash for Kim} did not only reach the public audience as well as Remco Breuker and his research team at Leiden University, but also got to both Jongerius and Piri as well. This broad range can easily be explained by the argument that the ‘news value’ of a certain topic grows when it is met with triggering events.\textsuperscript{109} In this case, the unfortunate and cruel death of ChŏnKyŏngsu was both unexpected and intense, thereby making this accident a triggering one. VICE, after releasing the documentary, provided related information sources to open the way for new streams of information. This, according to Rosert, is an important factor for increased awareness and eventually an emergence of norms.\textsuperscript{110} In a way, the documentary of VICE can be seen as one of the first incentives for norm entrepreneurs to start taking action to bring up this issue and carry it into the political realm.

Jongerius and Piri stated more than once that media helps to bring attention to this issue as well as that it builds pressure within the European Parliament as they are being put on a spotlight. This pressure indirectly aids both Jongerius as well as Piri in their own efforts to bring up this issue within Brussels as they argue this tension on the subject of both human rights and labor rights could indirectly hurt both the position and the image of the European Union. These assertions support the argument that the presence of

\textsuperscript{108}Finnemore, Martha, &Sikkink, Kathryn. 1998(a) p.901
\textsuperscript{110}Rosert, Elvira. 2018(a)
media is a critical condition when it comes to stimulating a reaction to norms that is often found in research on norms studies\textsuperscript{111} and is another example of the earlier mentioned idea of framing.

Jongerius and Piri feel that the commission of the European Union does not feel responsible to answer the critical written question due to an absence of social pressure in Brussels. If social pressure is not present, the influence members of the European Parliament can exert is nearly naught. She argues that, in order to have success with issues that go against ideals such as human rights, labor rights and other fields which serve as the foundation of Europe, one needs media pressure on one hand, while having the influence to hold those responsible accountable for their actions. This includes the incoming risk of shining a bad light on the reputation of the European Union. This aligns with the argument of Sikkink and Finnemore that norm entrepreneurs have the ability to name-shame norm actors, and that this step is an important one in leading the norm towards their so-called ‘cascade’\textsuperscript{112}.

As for the present, both Piri and Jongerius have their doubts about the effectiveness and the action undertaken by the commission about this topic. There are international agreements about tightening the sanctions towards North Korea, but it does not really address the issue mentioned. Jongerius adds that the present relationship with some member states hinders real effectiveness with the North Koreans in Europe. The same point goes is that most European member states (the Netherlands included) actually benefit from the fact that North Korean laborers are a cheap work force. To top it all, the EU even provides subsidies for these companies that hire North Korean laborers to expand their businesses.\textsuperscript{113} This factor falls accordingly to what Wylie argued as a hindrance to norm entrepreneurs in their path to moral persuasion as the material interest of the states makes a difference in whether norm initiation can be

called successful or not. A good thing however, is the future foundation of a European Labor inspection that might help to solve similar problems to the one of the North Korean laborers. This inspection will observe how well the laws of the earlier mentioned ICESCR and ICCPR are executed within the working atmosphere of European companies. However, the formation of this inspection is still developing and an eventual implementation deadline would take another two years on top. Jongerius guesses this inspection will not be official until late 2021.

What these interviews have shown, is that the different background and the original different motivation to undertake action for this issue (For Jongerius it was more about the display of the moral high horse whereas Piri is more involved in the human rights aspect) are slowly being converged while the network is emerging at the same time. Through the arguments, one can speculate that both Jongerius and Piri slowly got more occupied with opening up the truth of the commission of the European Union and were both in wait for answers that could explain the daily situation of North Korean migrant labor in Europe. Another big thing all these actors relied on was the presence of media. This conversion of motivation and demands makes it easier to create a social network and to increase pressure on the organs the network is taking action against.
CHAPTER V: CONCLUSION

This thesis explained the role of norm entrepreneurs in both network and norm emergence. Through a detailed case study and firsthand information of the norm entrepreneurs involved, this thesis described the emergence of a network, norm initiation, the reaction of both the general public as well as the actors involved on both amoral and political level, and the result of the entrepreneurs' efforts thus far. This last chapter will summarize the findings and outcomes, then suggest new avenues of investigation that may benefit from this paper. This paper specifically tried to reflect the case study and the following developments back to the profound findings from earlier research on norm and network studies. This ensures that this paper will be a helpful addition to the studies on norms and network theories.

5.1 Summary: From North Korea to Brussels

The death of a North Korean migrant labor in Poland sparked a debate on humanitarian issues that was broadcast around the world. It became apparent from the circumstances surrounding his death how North Korean laborers as a whole were working under extremely harsh circumstances in Europe; which was a scandal to Europeans because it contradicted the norms and values of labor and human rights that the European Union stands for.

Soon after the North Korean laborer's death and plight were exposed, media outlets and several non-governmental organizations (such as Leiden University and HRWF) started to spread awareness on the gravity of this issue. Through the initial efforts of the above-mentioned norm entrepreneurs, several political actors from the European Parliament got involved as well. Even though all these different actors
tried to improve labor conditions of migrant workers in Europe through norm and network emergence, there were more obstacles than anticipated. Even with all the pressure from the media, written questions within the parliament and direct letters to embassies in Poland, North Korean laborers continue to work throughout the whole of Europe under poor conditions.

This case study shows that, in order to change an already adopted norm or rule, norm entrepreneurs connected through a human rights network have to be actively involved and have to provide a lot of hard work and effort to have a chance at making a change. Especially because this case transcends national boundaries, the European Union as an agent becomes to play a larger role in this case. However, both within the European Parliament itself as well as the fact that this issue involves North Korea as a third party as well, makes this case a challenging experiment for the entrepreneurs fighting for a new model where migrant workers are working under. Although the original motivations of the various key actors were vastly different, the in-depth interviews showed that, at the same time this human rights network was emerging, there is also a conversion of both motivation and demands between the key actors. This shows that, in order to establish a successful network as well as an initiation for normative change, the nodes within the network should suit their priorities to the rest of the nodes in order to create a stronger chore within the network.

5.2 Key Findings of this Paper

This thesis demonstrates that network emergence and norm initiation and development is a difficult process, involving numerous, often concomitant, steps both forwards and backwards. The above-mentioned norm entrepreneurs came from a diverse range of backgrounds, including non-governmental organizations, universities, and members of the European Parliament. However, as we have learned
through direct contact and interviews with many of those involved, we have seen that even with their broad influence, the issue of North Korean laborers is a highly intractable problem that can take many years to fully resolve.

Norm entrepreneurs can face numerous political and moral obstacles, especially when they are pressured by political or economic means. For instance, Breuker had to stop further research into the issue of North Korean laborers because political actors could cut off his research funds and criticize him publicly. Moreover, both Jongerius and Piri too stated that even though their reach as a political actor is far broader than most NGO’s, there are still considerable limits to their influence within the political realm, especially when they try to cross national boundaries. This issue is particularly complicated by the fact that each member of the European Union maintains different levels of diplomatic relations with North Korea, preventing a strong and unified stance.

Another important factor for the norm entrepreneurs was the role of media outlets. As mentioned often throughout this article, the small successes and failures of these actors is closely correlated to the attention that this issue receives in the media: As Jongerius and Piristated in their interviews, they were only able to continue their parliamentary questions after Breuker received media attention by releasing the Slaves to the System report. Though the media coverage of the death of ChŏnKyŏngsu spread awareness of the issue of North Korean laborers quickly and widely, media attention slowly decreased in the years afterwards due to the lack of any concrete progress on the issue. Thus, it remains to be seen whether there will be permanent changes and/or changes surrounding the issue that we may be able to rely upon in the future. The most positive outcome that emerged from the efforts of the norm entrepreneurs was in helping to pressure the European Parliament in organizing a European Labor Inspection to investigate into the working conditions of North Koreans in Europe in the near future, allowing for a more direct engagement with the issues discussed above.
5.3 Further Research and Limitations

This thesis is an important step into resolving an ongoing problem. It is important to remember that the situation described in the case study as of now only describes the tipping point as described by the cycle of Sikkink and Finnemore. In this view, this thesis requires further research into the way a norm can develop into a broader norm that is accepted by the majority of the political actors involved and will therefore make the emergence of the network successful.

Another crucial point is the fact that international policies can have a great impact on this case as well. For example the foreign policy of the South Korean president Moon Jae-in, the sanctions of the UN on North Korea, the relationship between North Korea and the USA, as well as other factors, could all influence the progress of norm development. This thesis was more based on a bottom-up approach that emphasized the role of grassroots movements which sparked the first initiative to make the issue of North Korean laborers an important issue in humanitarian fields.

In this sense, this thesis would not only have brought new light to the case study of North Korean laborers in Europe, but also adds changes to norm studies and network theories in itself as well. The perception of norm and network emergence as a gradual process over time can be doubted when we look back at the in depth research of this paper. It can therefore be considered as important for norm studies to know how the role of norm entrepreneurs is played out and how situations and circumstances are mutually influencing the pursuit of norm entrepreneurs.

Future research could start where this thesis has left off by investigating the day to day activities of the active norm entrepreneurs. Subsequent research could also benefit from the open ends this thesis
has laid bare when it comes to political leverage and the close relationship between media attention and the successful application of social pressure by norm entrepreneurs. This could aid in forming a model that would help future norm entrepreneurs set up a clear view of the possible options and obstacles of norm initiation. If scholars are able to develop a cycle that not only describes how norms emerge, but also how a network is build and ways in which norm emergence can succeed, norm entrepreneurs would profit tremendously from such knowledge.

Although it may be too early to consider the developments of this case study to be a success, this thesis argues that the entire process cannot be dismissed as a failure either. According to the norm lifecycle of Sikkink and Finnemore, the situation as of now is most likely a tipping point, and needs only a few triggering events to turn the tides again. As the norm entrepreneurs have said, they will still try their best to keep this issue active in the future.


Firstpost. 2016. Malta denies visas for North Korean workers, sending them home.  

[https://www.nrc.nl/nieuws/2018/02/08/de-internationale-slavenbrigade-van-kim-jong-un-a1591491](https://www.nrc.nl/nieuws/2018/02/08/de-internationale-slavenbrigade-van-kim-jong-un-a1591491)


[doi:http://dx.doi.org.libproxy.snu.ac.kr/10.1163/19426720-01902002](http://dx.doi.org.libproxy.snu.ac.kr/10.1163/19426720-01902002)

Global Slavery Index https://www.globalslaveryindex.org/country/north-korea/ (accessed on 2018-04-13)

The Guardian. 2017. ‘Guest laborers’: the North Korean expats forced to feed the regime.  

The Guardian. 2015. North Korea putting thousands into forced labour abroad, UN says.  

[https://doi.org/10.1177/1354066113484344](https://doi.org/10.1177/1354066113484344)


ICESCR [http://www.ohchr.org/EN/ProfessionalInterest/Pages/CESCR.aspx](http://www.ohchr.org/EN/ProfessionalInterest/Pages/CESCR.aspx) (accessed on 2018-04-13)


O’Faircheallaigh, Ciaran. 2014. IR theory and domestic adoption of international norms. *International Politics,*
60

51(2), 155–176.


PVDA. 2014. Interview met Kati Piri, de nr. drie van de lijst voor Europa https://internationaal.pvda.nl/nieuws/interview-met-kati-piri-de-nr-drie-van-de-lijst-voor-europa/ (Dutch)


